LESSON 3
Censorship in Music

musicurious
2019/20 EDUCATION PROGRAMS OF THE COLORADO SYMPHONY
Bringing the youth concert experience and the story of Beethoven’s life through real-world topics
LESSON 3: Censorship in Music

SUMMARY
In this lesson, students will contend with the complexities of the First Amendment issue of musical censorship, which may serve to protect, yet also infringe upon the right to freedom of expression. Students will examine case law to learn how our judicial system has previously dealt with this issue. Additionally, students will investigate how other foreign governments, who are not bound by the First Amendment, have chosen to address this matter.

LEARNING OBJECTIVE
- Students will compare and contrast the motivations and repercussions of censorship on musical expression.
- Students will discuss the implications of the historic Supreme Court decision in Tinker v. Des Moines Independent Community School District on students' freedom of expression on school premises.
- Students will work collaboratively in small groups to research an assigned regime in which music has been, or is currently, censored due to either its anti-establishment themes, or out of fear of its perceived implications.

PRINCIPLES OF INSTRUCTION
- Colorado Academic Standards
- Learning Objective
- Essential Questions
- Enduring Understandings
- Vocabulary
- Materials & Resources
- Guiding & Extension Questions

INSTRUCTIONAL FRAMEWORK (Putting lessons into practice)
- Connection
- Teach
- Optional Extension
- Demonstration
- Active Involvement
- Independent or Small Group Work
- Share
- Link
- English Language Learner Tips
- Additional Resources
- Home Practice
- Culminating Project
GRADE 6
Colorado Academic Standards in Music: Grade Level Expectation
Standard 4. Aesthetic Valuation of Music
Grade Level Expectation:
4. Identify how music has been used in different historical periods.

Oral Expression and Listening
1. Employ appropriate presentation and collaboration strategies to meet the needs of a given task and purpose.
2. Develop, organize, and present ideas and opinions effectively.

GRADE 7
Colorado Academic Standards in Music: Grade Level Expectation
Standard 4. Aesthetic Valuation of Music
Grade Level Expectation:
4. Identify and describe the ways in which music is used as a historical record.

GRADE 8
Colorado Academic Standards in Music: Grade Level Expectation
Standard 4. Aesthetic Valuation of Music
Grade Level Expectation:
4. Compare and contrast uses for music in historical contexts.

2020 Colorado Academic Standards / Grade Level Expectation: Reading, Writing and Communicating
Oral Expression and Listening
1. Engage in effective collaborative discussions and analyze information presented.
LESSON CONNECTIONS

LEARNING OBJECTIVE
- Students will compare and contrast the motivations and repercussions of censorship on musical expression.
- Students will discuss the implications of the historic Supreme Court decision in Tinker v. Des Moines Independent Community School District on students' freedom of expression on school premises.
- Students will work collaboratively in small groups to research an assigned regime in which music has been, or is currently, censored due to either its anti-establishment themes or out of fear of its perceived implications.

ESSENTIAL QUESTIONS
- How is (has) music (been) used to raise people's awareness of injustices and a need for social reform?
- How is (has) music (been) censored by people in power? Why?
- Is censorship always a bad thing?
- How is (or has) music (been) used in an effort to persuade and control people's worldview and behavior?
- How is music indelibly connected to social and political life?

ENDURING UNDERSTANDINGS
- Music has been and continues to be used as a vehicle to promote social change and justice.
- People in power have censored music out of fear of noncompliance or unwanted change.
- Depending on the context, censorship may be viewed as either a good or a bad thing.
- Music has been used as a tool to shape people's worldview and control their behavior.
- Music is an inescapable part of social, cultural, and political life.

VOCABULARY
- Activism
- Censorship
- Contentious
- Controversial
- Egalitarianism
- Galvanize
- Humanitarian
- Inclusivity
- Noncompliance
- Reform
- Social justice
- Solidarity
- Transparency
- Treason
- Worldview

MATERIALS & RESOURCES
- Devices with Internet access
- Musical Freedom and Why Dictators Fear It
- What Does Beethoven's Ninth Symphony Mean?
GUIDING & EXTENSION QUESTIONS

- What is a worldview?
- What is your worldview?
- What has shaped your worldview?
- Does music have the power to change one’s worldview? If so, how?
- How can music influence people’s thoughts and actions?
- What role can music play in a movement for social change? Provide an example from history and present day.
- How has music led to social organization, bonding, and group cohesion?
- What are examples of music’s role in mobilizing support for popular movements demanding social justice? (e.g. songs that captured the message of the Me Too movement, or musicians who campaigned to free Tibet)
- When, why, how, and by whom has music been censored?
- What are motivations for censorship?
- How has fear (whether fear of change, political dissent, or fear of other ethnic or religious groups) contributed to government attempts to censor music? Provide a historical and present-day example.
- What is the range of censorship? (i.e. complete government-enforced legal prohibition of a musical work to specific edits within a piece)
- What are the different forms that censorship can take?
- How is censorship threatened as a result of the digital revolution and the widespread use of social media platforms?
- Does musical censorship violate freedom of expression, which is protected under our First Amendment rights? What safeguards people in other countries from censorship who are not protected by the First Amendment?
- What are the potential pros and cons of musical censorship?
- What are the dangers of becoming complacent in the face of injustices such as censorship?
- Should governments have the authority to dictate what artistic expression is acceptable or unacceptable? Why or why not?

8TH GRADE EXTENSION QUESTIONS

- How have streaming services made it more difficult to censor music?
- Is censorship sustainable in the digital era?
- Is there ever a time and/or place for musical censorship?
- Why do some broadcasters — such as Disney— impose stricter content guidelines than some other U.S. radio stations? (Consider the broadcaster’s primary target audience.)
- What is an example of a song that was not be broadcast on the radio because it was considered inappropriate in the aftermath of a specific event? (e.g. September 11th attacks)
- What precautions can we take to avoid being manipulated by what we see, hear, and read?
I. CONNECTION

“Beethoven’s worldview was “To do good whenever one can, to love liberty above all else, never to deny the truth, even though it be before the throne.”

On more than one occasion, Austrian censorship pushed Beethoven to opt for subtly in the expression of his Enlightenment ideals through music. He understood the need to appease the Viennese rulers on whose patronage he depended. In spite of this, Beethoven’s worldview and music, for the most part, remained aligned.

From historical accounts, it appears that Beethoven took on the approach that former U.S. President Theodore Roosevelt embodied – “Speak softly and carry a big stick; you will go far.” Beethoven rebelled against transgressions against humanity through his music. A few examples include Beethoven’s Third and Ninth Symphonies and his opera, Fidelio.

Beethoven’s Third Symphony ‘Eroica’ was both evocative and confrontational in that it was inspired by the ideals of the French Revolution: liberty, equality, fraternity, popular sovereignty, constitutionalism, and natural rights. The second movement, “Funeral March,” is particularly poignant because the music conjures the images from the massive state funerals that took place in Paris during that time.

For his Ninth Symphony, Beethoven chose to include his modified version of Friedrich Schiller’s poem “Ode to Joy” in the choral finale. Beethoven edited one of the lines to read, “All men become brothers.” Perhaps this was his way of invoking the importance of equality.

In 1783, Friedrich Schiller’s poem Ode to Joy was banned in Vienna. Twenty-five years later it was reauthorized after some editing. The original reads, “Beggars become brothers of princes.” The censored version reads, “All people become brothers.” Beethoven held such contempt for oppressive regimes that he recorded his own version of the line in his notebook, which read, “Princes are beggars.”

But even Beethoven’s music has a history of censorship. His only opera, Fidelio, was a celebration of liberty. At the time, it was banned until the Empress voiced that she was a fan of the story, which resulted in its premiere.

II. TEACH

There has always been a tension in music between control and creativity, dating back to the ancient Greek philosopher Plato who held that the state should prohibit the mixing of the musical modes (or ways of sequencing the notes of a scale; basically a mode is a type of scale). Plato went so far as to caution that this modal mixing would undermine both the cosmic order and social peace.

Provide students with several examples of individuals and/or groups who refused to be silenced, suppressed, or censored. The examples below also illustrate people who used music to access their inner hero and connection to self and others. Music has been used as a tool of emotional and physical perseverance and personal refuge in many of the direst of circumstances.

Through music, people succeeded not only in self-preservation and community strengthening, but also in the galvanization of social change. Throughout history, many courageous individuals chose music against all odds, in spite of the hardships imposed upon them, and the threat of torture, imprisonment, or in the most extreme cases, execution for their “transgression.”

- Rap artists who used their art of rhyme to escape impoverished and often dangerous neighborhoods
- The children’s opera, Brundibár, by Jewish Czech composer Hans Krása with a libretto by Adolf Hoffmeister, made most famous by performances by the children of Terezín in occupied Czechoslovakia
- Songs of the Underground Railroad as pathways to freedom
- Historical examples of Beethoven’s music being performed to commemorate something of great importance (e.g. Leonard Bernstein marked the fall of the Berlin Wall with Beethoven’s Ninth Symphony)

OPTIONAL EXTENSION

Have students read about the musical activities in the concentration camps during the Holocaust. The author presents the double-edged sword of music in the concentration camps – the pain inmates experienced when forced to perform for the SS guards, and the joy and refuge they found in the music they chose to perform, in spite of the danger it put them in.

music.curious.coloradosymphony.org
III. DEMONSTRATION


Discuss how the historic Supreme Court decision in Tinker v. Des Moines Independent Community School District (1969), which ruled that students do not “shed their constitutional rights to freedom of speech or expression at the schoolhouse gate,” protected students’ First Amendment rights.

How did the Substantial Disruption Test standard developed by the U.S. Supreme Court in response to the Tinker case define the boundaries for public school officials to determine when they may discipline students for their expression?

Resource explaining the Substantial Disruption Test:

mtsu.edu/first-amendment/article/1584/substantial-disruption-test

IV. ACTIVE INVOLVEMENT

Listen to selections from Beethoven’s Ninth Symphony.

■ What motivated Beethoven to compose this piece?
■ How did Beethoven use the communicative power of music in his Ninth Symphony to share his worldview about humanity?

V. INDEPENDENT OR SMALL GROUP WORK

Divide students into small groups to research past and present regimes in which music has been censored due to either its anti-establishment themes, or out of fear of its perceived implications. Please note that the list below is not comprehensive. There are many other instances in which censorship has governed artistic choices.

You may also choose to have students extend their learning by investigating the differences and similarities between censorship and propaganda.

The link next to each country provides additional information for teachers.

■ Germany (A Teacher’s Guide to the Holocaust: Nazi Approved Music:
  fcit.usf.edu/holocaust/arts/musReich.htm)
■ Russia (Russia Censorship of Younger Generation’s Music,
■ China (Article discusses censorship of Beethoven before, during, and after the Chinese Revolution:
■ North Korea (6 extraordinary facts about music in North Korea:
  bbc.co.uk/music/articles/271e6e43-bf76-4517-bfcf-64b7359640f6)
■ Iran (Rap is Banned in Iran, But the Underground Scene is Flourishing:
  vice.com/en_uk/article/yw59y7/rap-is-banned-in-iran-but-the-underground-scene-is-flourishing.iranian-children-are-dancing-to-pop-music,-and-the-government-is-furious:
  washingtonpost.com/world/2019/05/22/iranian-children-are-dancing-pop-music-government-is-furious/?utm_term=.1760dfd6e0b6)
■ Israel (Why Wagner’s Music Was Banned in Israel:
  theculturetrip.com/middle-east/israel/articles/why-wagner-music-was-banned-in-israel/)
■ Egypt (theatlantic.com/international/archive/2018/03/egypt-sisi-election-art-censorship/556325/)
■ Nigeria (books.openedition.org/pur/45137)
■ Uganda (indexoncensorship.org/2019/02/uganda-artists-should-not-have-to-seek-government-approval-to-make-their-art/)
VI. SHARE
After students have shared their findings, ask:
■ Is it possible to accurately measure the impact of censorship on artistic creativity? Why or why not?

VII. LINK
Music is one highly effective tool to raise social and political awareness and bring about change or reform. Recall the proverb made popular by Spiderman: “With great power comes great responsibility.” We must heed the power of music and use its power judiciously to create positive change.

ENGLISH LANGUAGE LEARNER TIPS
Provide sufficient “wait time” for all students, but especially for English Language Learners after posing questions. This silence provides the time and mental space to process the question, code-switch (i.e. thinking or speaking in one language and switching in one language and switching to another), and contribute a meaningful response.

ADDITIONAL RESOURCES
■ Blog post from The Daily Beethoven
  lvbandmore.blogspot.com/2010/08/813-how-much-was-beethoven-paid.html
■ Does Beethoven’s Music Sound Different 200 Years Later?
  bbc.co.uk/guides/z94pn39
■ Concerto: A Beethoven Journey (may be viewed for free with Amazon Prime membership)
■ Beethoven: The Innovator
  cdoq.blogspot.com/2013/03/beethoven-innovator.html
■ Why is a CD 74 minutes long? It’s because of Beethoven
  classicfm.com/discover-music/why-is-a-cd-74-minutes/
■ Williams v. Gaye court case
■ Theft: A History of Music (Free download of the graphic novel, which illustrates a 2000 year history of musical borrowing from Plato to rap)
  law.duke.edu/sites/default/files/centers/cspd/musiccomic/Theft.pdf (Published the Duke Center for the Study of Public Domain)

HOME PRACTICE
Ask students to write about an experience depicting a time when they found comfort or personal refuge through music. Challenge students to envisage how musical censorship could compromise their freedom of expression and opportunities to connect with other people.
PUTTING THE LESSON INTO PRACTICE

CULMINATING PROJECT
Select a free social media tool designed for educators and students.

3 Awesome Facebook templates for your Class:
educatorstechnology.com/2013/03/3-awesome-facebook-templates-for-your.html

Divide the class into partnerships or small groups to create a social media profile for one of the following composers: Beethoven, Haydn, Brahms, Wagner, Elgar, or Berlioz. Students may use their social media platform to share their composer’s thoughts, feelings, ideals, vulnerabilities, upcoming concerts, political views, social engagements, etc. through status updates, images, and memes. Posts should be based on primary and secondary source documents discovered through online research.

Alternatively, all partnerships or small groups may agree to place the composers in the same future time period. Then, composers may make comments on one another’s page.

This creative exercise provides an opportunity for students to delve deeper into the psychology of their assigned composer and the relationships among these great minds.

Share with students that Beethoven's life and compositions have been subject to countless, often distorted or conflicting interpretations, making it difficult to distinguish fact from fiction. Students may choose to research how prominent figures, including E.T.A. Hoffman, Hector Berlioz, Felix Mendelssohn, Franz Liszt, Richard Wagner, Johannes Brahms, Gustav Mahler, and Gustav Klimt all used Beethoven to further their personal or political agenda.

As one extreme example, Anton Schindler, a former secretary and early Beethoven biographer, went so far as to destroy and forge documents that he believed would challenge how he portrayed Beethoven to others.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Criteria</th>
<th>4 = Exemplary</th>
<th>3 = Accomplished</th>
<th>2 = Developing</th>
<th>1 = Beginning</th>
<th>Score</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Accurate content</td>
<td>All of the content is accurate</td>
<td>Most of the content is accurate (1-2 errors)</td>
<td>Some of the content is accurate (3 errors)</td>
<td>Almost no accurate content (4 or more errors)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Creative content</td>
<td>Includes at least one of each: Video Blog Post Press release Photos/images</td>
<td>Includes only 3 of the following: Video Blog Post Press release Photos/images</td>
<td>Includes only 2 of the following: Video Blog Post Press release Photos/images</td>
<td>Includes only 1 of the following: Video Blog Post Press release Photos/images</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of posts/activity</td>
<td>Includes at least 12 posts</td>
<td>Includes at least 10 posts</td>
<td>Includes at least 8 posts</td>
<td>Includes fewer than 8 posts</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“About” section in Facebook</td>
<td>Includes all of the following: Work and Education Places You've Lived Contact and Basic Info Family and Relationships Details About You Life Events</td>
<td>Includes at least 4 of the following: Work and Education Places You've Lived Contact and Basic Info Family and Relationships Details About You Life Events</td>
<td>Includes at least 3 of the following: Work and Education Places You've Lived Contact and Basic Info Family and Relationships Details About You Life Events</td>
<td>Includes only 1 or 2 of the following: Work and Education Places You've Lived Contact and Basic Info Family and Relationships Details About You Life Events</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Total Score
PUTTING THE LESSON INTO PRACTICE

* The “About” section in Facebook may need to be replaced with a different criteria depending on your chosen platform. You may also want to add a row to the sample analytic rubric for extra-credit points.

Consider challenging students to develop a Web site that they promote on their composer’s social media profile. Alternatively, students may create an additional group page to enrich their composer’s profile.

An additional fun resource to share with students:
If composers had Facebook: Beethoven’s profile
classicfm.com/composers/beethoven/guides/beethoven-facebook-profile/