Increased Equity, Diversity, and Inclusivity in Music Education: Insights from Other Community, State, and National Initiatives

OVERVIEW

In preparation for the Denver Music Educators Convening, organizers began by identifying the status, goals, and strategies currently in place in Denver, and then researching initiatives with similar missions and vision across the country. The research discovered 12 city, state, and national programs that have already begun to address many of the same issues being examined by Denver. Further research would certainly uncover additional initiatives.

Further investigations of these programs will harvest lessons in the areas of:

- Funding for collaborative efforts through foundations and public/private partnerships
- Identifying (and motivating) the appropriate collaborators
- Organization/governance of collaborative efforts
- Setting and tracking measurable goals
- Strategies for increasing public awareness of and support for music programs
- Mechanisms for disseminating information about music and music education
- Techniques for providing meaningful training for music educators

KEY FINDINGS FOR CITIES EXAMINED

- **Collaborative Efforts:**
  - “Eco-system” approaches through collaborative efforts of multiple agencies is the most commonly used city-wide approach – may include schools, cultural institutions and organizations, policymakers, philanthropists, businesses, parents, students, etc.
  - Developing effective cross-sector partnerships includes clearly delineated roles and relationships – communication, shared goals, buy-in, and adequate resources are essential to the success of these partnerships, but have been difficult to maintain.

- **City-Wide Goals:**
  - Most cities have defined 3 – 5 goals overall for their arts education efforts. At this point, most are aspirational, large goals. Few have demonstrated measurable success in these areas.
  - Some cities that are already “seeing success” have opted to focus on one specific, measurable goal / objective (e.g. Boston’s goal was to have 100% of all K-8 Boston Public School Students enrolled in once weekly, year-long arts instruction by 2012).

- **Data Tracking:**
  - Data tracking is cited by nearly all city-wide efforts as an important activity / goal to engage in, however what is being tracked (or considered to be tracked) varies.
  - Currently, successful active data tracking seems to be most focused on tracking inequities in access to arts education and then designing plans to address this (e.g. what schools have what classes available, what young people are participating in arts education and where, etc.).
Many cities cite the importance of identifying what “quality” arts education looks like and defining this. However, there were no observed or well-defined examples of this in action.

Additionally, some cities seem interested in developing / utilizing assessments to determine a young person’s acquisition of arts education “skills”. This also does not seem to be happening effectively in practice yet.

**APPROACHES / GOALS OF DENVER**

**Denver Student Strategic Plan:** Every student, regardless of his or her cultural background, race, or social-economic status, will have access to a high-quality Arts education to support his or her success in college and career. Arts education and programming should be:

1. An integral component of a 21st century education to develop the whole child
2. Rich and deep, comprised of rigorous standards personalized to meet students’ unique interests and learning styles
3. Relevant to historical, social, and cultural expression
4. Flexible in providing learning opportunities and career pathways for students that aim to graduate college and career-ready in Arts related fields
5. Built upon conceptual and skill-based instructional practices that impact all children

**Current DPS Goals:**

1. Develop a research plan to establish the current position of DPS arts programming and assess high quality instructional practices in arts education
2. Identify and implement arts instructional practices and pedagogy to effectively impact whole child education
3. Establish arts as a college and career pathway available to 100% of DPS students

**Recommendations from A+ Colorado:**

1. Assess student performance
2. Extend learning opportunities beyond school day
3. Increase strategic partnerships
4. Create defined pathways and easily available information about arts programs
5. Create vertically aligned standards

**Denver Music Strategy:** Community-led platform rooted in collective leadership and leveraging resources and influence.

1. Continue research, policy development and advocacy
2. Convene the Denver music advisory panel
3. Launch the Denver music advancement fund
4. Support safe and affordable creative spaces
5. Support emergency preparedness initiatives

**APPROACHES / GOALS OF OTHER CITIES**

**Austin**

**Creative Learning Initiative:** Methodical, ten-year plan to transform community through arts education using collective impact including education, government, arts, business, and philanthropy to provide what every child should learn in arts-rich schools. Schools supported with:

- Training to deliver arts-based instruction
- Design and implement individualized learning plans
- Map the gaps
- Activate solutions in neighborhoods to address equity and access to arts education

1. Create arts-rich schools for all students
2. Create a community network that supports and sustains the arts-rich life of every child
3. Develop leaders and systems that support and sustain quality creative learning for the development of the whole child
4. Demonstrate measurable effects on students, families, schools, and our community

**Boston**

1. Expand direct arts instruction for students during the school data; use data to identify access and inequities
2. Build the capacity of the district’s central office to support expanded arts education programs and curricula
3. Collect and analyze data
Organize stronger and more efficient partnerships among school and community arts and cultural groups to ensure students receive highest quality of arts instructions possible

**Commonalities in City-Wide Arts Efforts Studied by Boston**

1. Public-private partnerships that engage public education systems, municipal governments, cultural organizations, philanthropies, communities, and families
2. Data-based assessment that identifies gaps in access and equity, established measurable public commitments and policies, and tracks progress
3. Regular communications about progress toward goals and funding to encourage community members to advocate for and take ownership of these efforts
4. Investing in the people engaged in this work at the deepest level and connecting they with others to help move the needle
Chicago – Creative Schools/Ingenuity

The Creative Schools Survey is an annual survey that is administered by Ingenuity, which collects data on arts programming in CPS schools in the areas of staffing and instruction, budgeting and planning, and partnerships. The data is entered by each school's Arts Liaison and informs the school's category along a continuum that is reflected on schools' annual progress report. The five categories along the Creative Schools Certification continuum range from "Incomplete Data" to "Excelling."

Schools are encouraged to use the Creative Schools Certification to help them:

- Make strategic decisions about arts programming
- Identify the resources and supports necessary to grow arts instruction
- Connect to professional development opportunities for principals and teachers
- Become eligible for the Creative Schools Fund
- Advance the District’s goal of offering every CPS student a high-quality arts education

The data collected populate Ingenuity's artlook Map, an interactive tool which allows users to search for arts education data from public schools and arts organizations in Chicago. Broader map searches can be conducted as well, allowing users to explore arts education data by community area, zip code, CPS network, Creative Schools Certification, and more.

Chicago – Musical Pathways Initiative (CMPI)

CMPI aims to build a robust music training pathway for talented Chicago-area student musicians from traditionally underrepresented backgrounds. CMPI brings together a network of more than 20 Chicago non-profit music and youth-focused organizations who will work to identify talented, motivated students early in their training, and together, help them achieve their full musical potential. Ultimately, the goal of CMPI is to increase diversity in America’s professional music landscape, particularly its orchestras.

Funded by a $3.5 million grant over three-and-one-half years from The Andrew W. Mellon Foundation to a consortium of Chicago-area organizations dedicated to music and education will be used to increase diversity in the classical music field through the establishment of the Chicago Musical Pathways Initiative (CMPI).

Implementation of the Chicago Musical Pathways Initiative will be led by Merit School of Music and the Chicago Youth Symphony Orchestras (CYSO), an organization that has provided toplevel orchestral programming for students from across the Chicago region for more than 70 years. Steering Team partners participating in the implementation of CMPI include:

- Chicago High School for the Arts (ChiArts);
- Chicago Sinfonietta;
- DePaul University School of Music;
- The Negaunee Music Institute at the Chicago Symphony Orchestra; and
- The Ravinia Festival.
**Dallas – Big Thought**

Our commitment is that learner-centered education be available to every child, regardless of background or circumstance. We are guided by a transformational vision for the future of education created by 28 ideologically diverse education stakeholders brought together to reimagine education.

**Houston**

**Arts Access Initiative:** Action plan for ensuring equitable arts access for every K-8 Houston Independent School District student. Campuses are provided with arts-based professional development, unique community collaborations, and funding.

1. **Equity** – work to understand and counter obstacles that prevent all students from having access to the arts
2. **Impact** – ensure that the arts are a meaningful and substantial element of an excellent education; measure impact
3. **Sustainability** – diverse organization, funding, levels of outreach so that changes and turnover in one area do not impact the eco-system

**New Orleans**

**New Orleans Arts Education Alliance:** Collective impact project to ensure access for all children to an education that includes exemplary arts instructions. Includes parents, educational community, government, cultural institutions, business, and philanthropy. Provide professional development opportunities, share information, support schools, and document power of the arts in children’s lives.

1. Expand access to excellent arts rich schools
2. Invest in arts education, developing resources to ensure sustainability
3. Communicate and connect with stakeholders, partners, and community
4. Advocate for arts education by building understanding and support
5. Connect students, parents, and schools with arts education resources through a digital hub

**Philadelphia**

**Philadelphia Music Alliance for Youth (PMAY) Artist’s Initiative:** Collective work of 10 leading Philadelphia music education institutions to fully support students from underrepresented communities to study music performance at collegiate level and beyond.

1. Identify student in development of music programs
2. Share resources
3. Create robust student support systems
4. Create city-wide ecosystem

- **Philadelphia Music Alliance for Youth (PMAY) Artist’s Initiative:** Support 5th – 12th grade students from underrepresented communities and low-income households to pursue their dream of become
a professional classical musician – fewer than 5% of musicians in America orchestras are African American or Latino. Students receive financial support for lessons, classes, orchestra participation, and summer camp.

**San Diego – Arts Empower**

Arts Empower is a collective impact initiative working to improve and support arts education in San Diego County by:

- Building leadership
- Promoting advocacy
- Encouraging and assisting districts in strategic planning and implementation
- Fostering meaningful partnerships
- Facilitating professional learning
- Measuring access to equitable arts education

Activities include sponsoring an annual Arts Empower mega conference:

- A one-of-a-kind forum that unites teachers of all arts disciplines, elementary multiple-subject teachers, teaching artists, school administrators, and arts organization members all in a park rich in the arts.
- Professional learning and conversations focused on arts education developed in partnership with the county’s arts education organizations and Balboa Park arts and culture institutions.

**Seattle – Creative Advantage**

The Creative Advantage is a city-wide initiative to establish equitable access to arts education for each and every student in Seattle Public Schools. The Creative Advantage is made possible through a public-private partnership with Seattle Public Schools, the City of Seattle Office of Arts & Culture, Seattle Foundation, and community arts partners.

The Creative Advantage is a city-wide initiative to establish equitable access to arts education for all students in Seattle Public Schools. It is made possible through a public-private partnership with Seattle Public Schools, the City of Seattle Office of Arts & Culture, Seattle Foundation, and community arts organizations. Implementation of The Creative Advantage began in 2013 in the Central Arts Pathway with 13 schools. Over the past five years, The Creative Advantage has expanded to over 40 schools throughout the district, with the goal of reaching all Seattle Public Schools.

The Community Arts Partner Roster is a vetted list of teaching artists and community arts and culture organizations approved to work in Seattle Public Schools through the Creative Advantage. Schools, community agencies, and other public and private entities are encouraged to access this list when seeking partners to lead creative learning opportunities with their program participants.
APPROACHES / GOALS OF STATES

**California**

**Create CA:** Coalition of dedicated and innovated leaders who understand that together we have the power to create lasting change for every California student.

1. Convene art educators
2. Coordinate arts education data and help schools/districts make sense of their data by assembling data teams and helping with the collecting and assessment of data
3. Evaluate arts education programs – conduct gap analysis and create rubric for effective practice
4. Support district strategic arts plans
5. Connect efforts of arts equity champions

APPROACHES / GOALS OF NATIONAL PROGRAMS

**The Creative Youth Development National Partnership**

**Vision:** All young people will have equitable access to opportunities to develop their creative potential, to live richer, fuller lives and develop the critical learning and life skills they need to become active contributors to their communities.

The Creative Youth Development National Partnership is working in concert with the broader field to drive collective action in three strategic priorities to advance creative youth development:

- VISIBILITY & IMPACT: Documenting and Communicating Outcomes and Impact
- FUNDING: Building Pathways to Funding
- FIELD BUILDING: Professional Development, Networking & Technical Assistance